

Debate: The Art of Persuasion – Scoring Sheet

Student Name: _____

Place a score (1-4) in each row corresponding to the student's college readiness level.

Exceeding College Ready (4): Substantially exceeds the performance expectations**College Ready (3):** Shows proficiency in all of the performance expectations**Approaching College Ready (2):** Meets only some of the performance expectations**Initiating College Ready (1):** Does not yet meet the performance expectations

KEY COGNITIVE SKILLS	Student's Self-Assessment	Instructor's Score
Reasoning (considers arguments and conclusions of self and others; constructs well-reasoned arguments to explain phenomena, validate conjectures, or support positions)		
Academic Behaviors (strives for accuracy and precision; perseveres to complete and master tasks)		
Academic Integrity (includes the ideas of others and the complexities of the debate, issue, or problem)		
FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS	Student's Self-Assessment	Instructor's Score
Reading Across the Curriculum (identifies the key information and supporting details; analyzes textual information critically; annotates, summarizes, paraphrases, and outlines texts when appropriate)		
Writing Across the Curriculum (writes clearly and coherently using standard writing conventions)		
Research Across the Curriculum (explores a research topic; evaluates the validity and reliability of sources; synthesizes and organizes information effectively; designs and presents an effective product)		
ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS STANDARDS	Student's Self-Assessment	Instructor's Score
Writing (generates ideas and gathers information relevant to the topic and purpose, keeping careful records of outside sources; evaluates relevance, quality, sufficiency, and depth of preliminary ideas and information; formulates a thesis)		
Speaking (participates actively and effectively in group discussions; plans and delivers focused and coherent presentations that convey clear and distinct perspectives and demonstrate solid reasoning)		
Listening (analyzes and evaluates the effectiveness of a public presentation; interprets a speaker's message and identifies the position taken and the evidence in support of that position; listens critically and responds appropriately to presentations; listens actively and effectively in group discussions)		

See reverse for
comments.

Score	College Readiness Level
32-36	Exceeding College Ready
27-31	College Ready
13-26	Approaching College Ready
0-12	Initiating College Ready

Total Score: _____

Grade: _____

See Scoring Guide for grade
conversion chart.

Debate: The Art of Persuasion – Scoring Guide

Note: The letters and numbers of the skills below refer to their designation in the College and Career Readiness Standards.

KEY COGNITIVE SKILLS

B. Reasoning

1. Consider arguments and conclusions of self and others.

College Ready Description: Student identifies counterexamples to his or her position. Student questions whether the claims of others are supported by evidence.

Evidence for Scoring: In spoken and written work, student acknowledges counterexamples to his or her position, challenging or conceding the quality of support as appropriate.

2. Construct well-reasoned arguments to explain phenomena, validate conjectures, or support positions.

College Ready Description: Student explores in-depth a debatable topic, including claims and supporting evidence for multiple sides of an issue.

Evidence for Scoring: In spoken and written work, student offers alternative claims and appropriate evidence that move beyond the obvious.

D. Academic Behaviors

3. Strive for accuracy and precision.

College Ready Description: Student carefully and correctly collects and reports all research.

Evidence for Scoring: Student effectively researches his or her position using online resources, the library, or books salient to the topic and, keeps careful records in APA or MLA format, accurately cites sources he or she used for support.

4. Persevere to complete and master tasks.

College Ready Description: Student submits a final work product that reflects a thorough understanding of the topic and meets all requirements of the assignment.

Evidence for Scoring: Student's position paper considers the topic from multiple perspectives. Student uses the *Debate Organizer* handout to record sufficient details in support of multiple perspectives to strengthen his or her position paper.

F. Academic Integrity

3. Include the ideas of others and the complexities of the debate, issue, or problem.

College Ready Description: Student adequately addresses the complexity of debate by presenting more than one perspective.

Evidence for Scoring: Student demonstrates understanding of the complexity of the issue by carefully and accurately recording research findings representing multiple perspectives on the *Debate Organizer* handout and by accurately representing those perspectives in his or her position paper.

FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS**A. Reading Across the Curriculum****4. Identify the key information and supporting details.**

College Ready Description: Student outlines text to identify key rhetorical devices and considers their effectiveness. Student thoroughly summarizes the major points of his or her research and includes supporting examples and illustrations and any conflicting points of view.

Evidence for Scoring: Student takes notes of particular rhetorical devices present in a debate and considers how such strategies may be useful in an argument. Drawing on the *Debate Organizer* handout, the student adequately supports main points developed in his or her position paper with textual evidence.

5. Analyze textual information critically.

College Ready Description: Student thoughtfully demonstrates how language is used to construct arguments while reading, viewing, or listening to a fully developed debate. Student draws conclusions based on textual evidence.

Evidence for Scoring: Student critically assesses claims made in debate and in researched materials.

6. Annotate, summarize, paraphrase, and outline texts when appropriate.

College Ready Description: Student annotates rhetorical strategies present in a transcript of a debate and considers with others the effectiveness of these tools in light of the particular topic and accurately represents positions presented.

Evidence for Scoring: Student's position paper and *Debate Organizer* handout accurately represent positions and note techniques used in their presentation.

B. Writing Across the Curriculum**1. Write clearly and coherently using standard writing conventions.**

College Ready Description: Student effectively employs the style and rhetorical devices present in the debates studied in class in his or her own written position paper. Student uses proper grammar, mechanics, punctuation, and spelling, with few or no errors.

Evidence for Scoring: Student writes in a clear and a logical manner so that their message is easily understood by the reader and/or listener.

C. Research Across the Curriculum**2. Explore a research topic.**

College Ready Description: Student explores in-depth a debatable topic, including claims and supporting evidence for multiple sides of an issue, by locating a range of credible sources.

Evidence for Scoring: Student's position paper and *Debate Organizer* handout present research representing multiple positions found in online resources, the library, or books salient to the topic.

4. Evaluate the validity and reliability of sources.

College Ready Description: Student evaluates the strengths and limitations of research found in online resources, the library, or books salient to the topic.

Evidence for Scoring: Student’s position paper and *Debate Organizer* handout assess the relative value of research findings.

5. Synthesize and organize information effectively.

College Ready Description: Student determines a logical and effective order for presenting quotations and evidence.

Evidence for Scoring: Student uses the *Debate Organizer* handout to categorize arguments for or against a particular topic or issue, paying special attention to supporting details, like statistics, facts, or expert perspectives on an issue, and employs rhetorical language in the debate.

6. Design and present an effective product.

College Ready Description: Student develops a thoughtfully constructed argument in the debate and position paper.

Evidence for Scoring: Student constructs a paper that is both persuasive and interesting to readers or listeners.

ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS STANDARDS

I. Writing

A.2, 3. Compose a variety of texts that demonstrate clear focus, the logical development of ideas in well-organized paragraphs, and the use of appropriate language that advances the author’s purpose.

College Ready Description: Student generates ideas and gathers information relevant to the topic and purpose, keeping careful records of outside sources. Student evaluates relevance, quality, sufficiency, and depth of preliminary ideas and information, organizes material generated, and formulates a thesis.

Evidence for Scoring: Student’s position paper articulates a thesis; stays focused on the topic and purpose; presents claims supported by relevant and ample evidence that is of high quality; presents information in a clear and organized fashion; and documents sources.

III. Speaking

B.2, 3. Develop effective speaking styles for both group and one-on-one situations.

College Ready Description: Student participates actively and effectively in group discussions. Student plans and delivers focused and coherent presentations that convey clear and distinct perspectives and demonstrate solid reasoning.

Evidence for Scoring: Student participates actively in discussion by looking directly at speaker(s), taking careful notes, and then referencing statements by other group member(s) when contributing own comments.

IV. Listening

A.1, 2. Apply listening skills as an individual and as a member of a group in a variety of settings (e.g., lectures, discussions, conversations, team projects, presentations, interviews).

College Ready Description: Student analyzes and evaluates the effectiveness of a public presentation. Student interprets a speaker's message and identifies the position taken and the evidence in support of that position

Evidence for Scoring: Student listens attentively by looking directly at speaker(s), asking for clarification or additional information as appropriate, taking careful notes, and referencing statements by other group member(s) if contributing own comments.

B.1, 3. Listen effectively in informal and formal situations.

College Ready Description: Student listens critically and responds appropriately to presentations. Student listens actively and effectively in group discussions.

Evidence for Scoring: Student listens attentively by looking directly at speaker(s), asking for clarification or additional information as appropriate, taking careful notes, and referencing statements by other group member(s) if contributing own comments.

Debate: The Art of Persuasion – Scoring Instructions

Place a score (1-4) in each row of the scoring sheet corresponding to the student's college readiness level.

Exceeding College Ready (4): Substantially exceeds the performance expectations

College Ready (3): Shows proficiency in all of the performance expectations

Approaching College Ready (2): Meets only some of the performance expectations

Initiating College Ready (1): Does not yet meet the performance expectations

Suggested Grade Conversion:

This chart reflects equal weight given to each skill. As key cognitive skills, foundational skills, and discipline content knowledge are all important elements of college readiness, we recommend this grading approach. However, you may certainly choose to implement different weights to particular scales and assign a grade at your discretion.

Score	Grade		Score	Grade		Score	Grade		Score	Grade
36	100		28	87		20	77		12	68
35	99		27	85		19	76		11	66
34	98		26	84		18	75		10	64
33	96.5		25	83		17	74		9	62
32	95		24	81.5		16	73		8	60
31	93		23	80		15	72			
30	91		22	79		14	71			
29	89		21	78		13	70			